



NEWS FROM:
Office of the Public Defender
Matt Shirk, Fourth Judicial Circuit
www.MattShirkPublicDefender.com

Contact: Matt Bisbee, Public Information Officer (904) 718-3616 or MPB@PD4.COJ.net

Assistant Public Defenders Victorious in October Trials

Jacksonville, FL (November 8, 2011): The State vs. Amy Carter-Bivins was tried on October 13th. The Defendant faced three counts of Uttering a Forged Instrument. Mrs. Carter-Bivens was accused of stealing checks from her husband. Her friend, the State's accusing witness, cashed the checks at a bank



three separate times. Mrs. Carter-Bivins was in the bank each time and was caught on surveillance video sitting in the waiting room. The State proceeded on a principle theory despite not charging its witness, the woman who actually uttered the checks each time. Assistant Public Defender Tyler Gates (pictured, left) led the Defense. He and his Co-Counsel, APD Nate Carter (pictured, right) argued that the State's witness was not credible due to her four prior Felony convictions and that she blamed their client for the wrongdoing in order to avoid prosecution. The jury deliberated for just under one hour and ruled Not Guilty on all three counts.

In County Court, a jury heard The State vs. Joseph Alcala on October 20th. Mr. Alcala faced a Domestic Battery charge stemming from allegations that he pushed his wife out of bed, causing her to hit her head. In his first jury trial, APD Gary Shumard (c) led the Defense with assistance from APD Ronnie Roberts (l). The team argued that injuries were sustained a week prior to the date of the alleged offense. The argument led to the exclusion of all photographic evidence in the case. Other pictures were excluded due to relevance. APD Shumard said the State's case relied heavily on photographs. The jury ruled Not Guilty.

